Pronoun Second Position in Comanche
as an Archaic Survival
Todd McDaniels
Comanche Nation College

Steele (1977: 550, 558) posits that Comanche created second position pronouns relatively recently.

A contrary position is taken here:
Pronoun second position in Comanche is a relic, which has an unbroken genetic relationship with other Numic languages.

Comanche has:
•"Independent" pronouns
–These occur in SOV order (about as rigidly as English follows SVO).
•Second position pronouns
–These occur after the first word or after the first phrase.

The SOV ordered pronouns and the second position pronouns have identical morphemes in 1st and 2nd person. **The SOV pronouns are anaphoric, used in connected speech. The second position pronouns are exophoric, used in isolated utterances.**

Table 1 Comanche: SOV ordered and 2nd position ordered pronouns.

	Singular	Dual	Plural
1P Nom.	*ni*	*ta-kwi* (incl)	*tani* (incl)
		ni-kwi (excl)	*nini* (excl)
2P Nom.	*inni*	*mimi-kwi*	*mimi*

1. (a) Tɨasɨ-se   nɨ   tɨhka.
        again-DM   1P   eat
        Again I ate.

   (b) Nɨ-se   tɨhka.
        1P-DM   eat
        I ate.

   (c) *Nɨ   Tɨhka.
        1P   eat
        I ate.

   (d) Tɨhka   nɨ.
        eat   1P
        I ate.

   (e) *Tɨhka-se   nɨ.
        eat-DM   1P
        I ate.

•Distinctions in the selection of morphemes between SOV pronouns and second position pronouns arise in third person. There are three sorts of SOV ordered subject pronouns:

a. Uninflected deictic pronouns,
b. Nominative/emphatic -*sɨ* inflected pronouns, and
c. Nominative -*tɨ* inflected pronouns

Uninflected Deictic Pronouns

Proximal	Medial	Distal	Scattered
i	*o**	*u*	*e***

-*sɨ* Inflected Pronouns

Proximal	Medial	Distal
i-sɨ	*o-sɨ*	*u-sɨ*

Table 2 Third person SOV ordered pronouns

	Singular	Dual	Plural
Proximal	*s-i-tɨ*	*s-i-tɨ-kwɨ*	*s-i-tɨɨ*
Medial	*s-o-tɨ*	*s-o-tɨ-kwɨ*	*s-o-tɨɨ*
Distal	*s-u-tɨ*	*s-u-tɨ-kwɨ*	*s-u-tɨɨ*
Scattered	*s-e-tɨ*	—	*s-e-tɨɨ*

2. U-se   sohoto'i-tɨ.
   3P/DIST-DM   climb-IMPF
   He/she/that's climbing.

3. U-sɨ-se   sohoto'i-tɨ.
   3P/DIST-N-DM   climb-IMPF
   He/she/that's climbing.

4. S-u-tɨ-se   sohoto'i-tɨ.
   DEF-3P/DIST-N-DM   climb-IMPF
   He/she/it's climbing.

Definite pronouns like that in (4) are exclusively anaphoric.

Table 3 Third person second position subject pronouns.

	Singular	Dual	Plural
3P Nom. In vicinity	*ma*	*ma-tɨ-kwɨ*	*ma-tɨɨ*
3P Nom. Distal	*u*	*u-tɨ-kwɨ*	*u-tɨɨ*

Comanche second position pronouns are exclusively exophoric.
5. Sohoto'i-tɨ   **u**.
   climb-IMPF   3P/DIST[subj]
   He/she/that's climbing.

6. Sohoto'i-tɨ   **ma**.
   climb-IMPF   3P[subj]
   He/she/that's climbing.

"The demonstratives built on ma- are not used in the subjective, …" (Crum and Dayley1993: 26)

*Note: uninflected deictics found in Comanche have not been observed in Shoshone.

However, there is in fact Shoshone data with *ma* subject:

Western Shoshone:
6. Ke   **ma**   sumpanai-n.
   NEG   3P   know-PF
   He doesn't know.
(Maxine Hall, Ken Hale eliciting 1958,
Indiana University Archives of Traditional Music
Accession no. 85-609-F, OT7964)

Gosiute Shoshone:
7. "E-kkih   e-wai   **ma**   naakkiku"   me   s-u-tɨ.
    PROX-LOC{=here}   PROX-like   3P   happen   QUOT   DEF-3P/DIST-N
    "It happened like this," he said. (Miller 1972: 59)

8. "Hinna   **kia ma**   noo   nasuahtsi-hkwa"   me.
    something.A   INF   3P   must   forget-DIR(away)   QUOT
    "He (mule) must have forgotten something." (Miller 1972: 75)

2

9. "Ke," me u niikwi-nna, "hinna **kia ma** tɨasɨ
    NEG   QUOT   3P,A tell-PROG   something,A INF 3P   again

      nasuahtsi-hkwa," me u-niikwi-nna.
      forget-DIR(away)   QUOT   3P/DIST-tell-PROG

      "No," he said, "he must have forgotten something else again," he said.
      (Miller 1972: 75)

10. I-kkihi   Tsɨts Rents **u**   i-nankwa   i-kkih.
      PROX-LOC   PN   3P[subj]   PROX-over.at PROX-LOC
      It was here this side of Church Ranch. (Miller 1972: 89)

11. Waihyanna **u**   nɨaiyu   tokai supe s-u-kkan tapeni
      burn-PROG   3P[subj]   blow-IMPF exactly then   DEF-3P-A day

      u   patuuwammi-nku nɨai-yu-wih.
      3P[obj] get.water-SR   blow-IMPF-?

      There was burning on that day, it was blowing; when he went to get
      water it was blowing. (Miller 1972: 66)

Absence of plural morphology:
12. Nuun **kia-ma**   u   hupia-pai,   me.
      must   INF-3P[subj] 3P[poss] song-have   QUOT
      "They must have songs of their own." (Miller 1972: 79)

13. ke **ma**   sumpanai-nna.
      NEG 3P[subj] know-PROG
      "they don't know anything." (Miller 1972: 45)

14. S-i-kka   hukkana   **ma**   nakɨtommo-hkan-tɨ e-kkih
      DEF-PROX-A pickleweed 3P[subj]   winter-STAT-IMPF   PROX-LOC

      mokottsihnaihkantɨ makuppa ma   tsat-tanii-hkan-tɨ
      sack   3P-inside   3P[obj] INST(hand)-put.away-STAT-IMPF

      sokoppɨh-a   hota-kkan-tɨ.
      ground-ABS-A dig-STAT-IMPF

      They lived on the pickleweed in the winter time, made sacks, put it
      inside it, and dug a hole in the ground. (Miller 1972: 46)

Uninflected deictic pronouns are the source for 3rd Person 2nd Position.

1	2		
{i, ma, a, u}	X	…	SOV
Demonstrative			

1	2		
X	{i, ma, a, u}	…	2nd Position
	Definite		

With the reconstruction of second position in Central Numic, second position is attested in all three branches of Numic.
•Western Numic (at least 1st Person reconstructable)
–Northern Paiute (1st Person only)
–Mono (3rd Person dems. Appear to be recently added)
•Central Numic
–Comanche (yes, extensive)
–Shoshone (residual)
•Southern Numic
–Ute (yes, extensive)
–Kawaiisu (unsure - verbal pron. clitics derived from second position?)

However, Central Numic and Western Numic seem to differ from Southern Numic in certain conspicuous ways.
•A number of the pronoun second morphemes are different in Ute.

•Ute allows second position to co-occur with other non-second position pronouns (this property is consistent with other a number of other UA languages outside Numic, and is probably a property that should be reconstructed).
•Ute does not maintain an opposition between anaphorically accessible pronouns and exophorically accessible pronouns, as Comanche does.

Each difference is not nearly as significant as it seems at first glance.
•Some of the pronoun second morphemes are virtually the same.

Ute:
  1Psg   **-n** (sometimes occurs as **-nɨ**
               e.g. Givón 1985: 16, 46, 54, 58, 62, 79, 106.
               This 1Psg is consistent throughout Numic)

  3Psg   **-'u**

  (3Psg   **-'a** is the same as the P-C. Numic medial
             deictic (Comanche *o*) among the <u>uninflected</u>
             <u>pronouns</u>, which were posited as the source
             for 2nd Position Prons. in third person)

•When examining the first two cycles of Givón's *Ute Traditional Narratives*, it can be seen that co-occurrence with other non-second position pronouns is relatively uncommon.

•Ute texts show that a significant disparity exists between third person narrative and character direct speech, such that the odds of getting a second position pronominal is much greater inside direct speech than outside direct speech.

"…one must remember that these pronouns are still similar to anaphora in one crucial respect: They are most normally used to refer to topic-NP's that have been last mentioned in the <u>directly preceding</u> clause in discourse, or in a similarly <u>proximate</u> preceding exchange" (Givón 1980: 310).

Ute Text Study
The following quantitative study examined the first two cycles in Givón (1985), the Sinawav Cycle and the Coyote Cycle. The study hinges upon the central observation that exophoric references have no opportunity to occur in narrative except as contained within the direct speech of a character.

The study ignored:
•Object clitics
•Subordinate clauses
•Subject pronominals found in the framing of characters' direct speech (except in Table 6, where it became the object of study).

Table 4 Second position versus independent pronouns in third person in & out of character direct speech.

	2Pos	Indep.
3P in DS	10	10
3P outside DS	68	257

$$N = 345,\ df = 1,\ \chi^2 = 9.1119,\ p < .01$$

Table 5 First person inside direct speech versus third person outside direct speech.

	2Pos	Indep.
1P in DS	27	32
3P outside DS	68	257

$$N = 384,\ df = 1,\ \chi^2 = 16.5356,\ p < .001$$

Table 6 A comparison between pronominals inside & outside the framing of direct speech. (Note: the data shown in the PowerPoint were incorrect in a glaringly obvious fashion. This prevented this point from being properly presented in the talk. The data as given below within Table 6 of this handout are correct.)

	2Pos	Indep.
3P in framing of DS	11	91
3P outside both DS & framing of DS	68	257

$$N = 427, \; df = 1, \; \chi^2 = 5.2912, \; p < .05$$

Conclusion

•**Residue of pronoun 2nd position occurs in Shoshone,**
–so there is no discontinuity between Comanche and the rest of Numic.
–2Pos pronouns can be reasonably reconstructed in all three branches of Numic
•**A plausible pathway from Ute to Comanche is at hand.**
–The pragmatics of pronoun selection in Comanche is comparable to some of the tendencies for pronoun selection in Ute narrative.
–The lack of a pronoun second option in the framing of direct speech in Comanche is reflected in the very strong tendency to avoid it in Ute.

References

Canonge, Elliott and Emily Riddles 1958. *Comanche Texts*. Norman: The Summer Institute of Linguistics of the University of Oklahoma.

Charney, Jean Ormsbee 1993. *A Grammar of Comanche*. Lincoln/London: University of Nebraska Press.

Crum, Beverly and Jon P. Dayley 1993. Western Shoshoni Grammar, Occasional Papers and Monographs in Cultural Anthropology and Linguistics. Boise State University.

Givón, Talmy 1980. *Ute reference Grammar*. Ignacio, CO: Ute Press, The Southern Ute Tribe.

– – – (ed.) 1985. *Ute Traditional Narratives*. Ignacio, CO: Ute Press, The Southern Ute Tribe.

Hale, Ken 1958. Archived Recordings: Arizona Ute and Shoshone. Indiana University Archives of Traditional Music Accession no. 85-609-F, OT7964

McDaniels, Todd A. 1996-2008. Comanche Fieldnotes.

– – – 1999. Sentential second position in Comanche, *University of British Columbia Working Papers in Linguistics, The Workshop on Structure And Constituency in Languages of the Americas 4*, March 27-29, 1999, pp.93-105.

– – – 2002. Referential bleaching and emphasis, *NLS 01, Proceedings from the 2001 Niagara Linguistics Society, pp.91-106.*

Miller, Wick R. 1972. *Newe Natekwinappeh: Shoshoni Stories and Dictionary*. Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press.

Norris, Evans J. 1986. A Grammar Sketch and Comparative Study of Eastern Mono. Doctoral Dissertation: University of California, San Diego.

Robinson, Lila Wistrand and James Armagost 1990. Comanche Dictionary and Grammar. The Summer Institute of Linguistics and the University of Texas at Arlington.

Steele, Susan 1977. "Clisis and Diachrony," in *Mechanisms of Syntactic Change*, Charles N. Li, ed. Austin and London: University of Texas Press.

Thornes, Timothy Jon 2003. A Northern Paiute Grammar with Texts. Doctoral Dissertation: University of Oregon.

Zigmond, Maurice L., Curtis Booth, and Pamela Munro 1991. *Kawaiisu, A Grammar and Dictionary with Texts*. Berkeley, Los Angeles, and Oxford: University of California Press.